INTERSPECIFIC FEEDING AMONG BIRDS: A REVIEW

By Marilyn Muszalski Shy

Much recent attention has been devoted to intraspecific helpers at the nest. Skutch (1935, 1961, 1976) listed several instances of interspecific helping, but a thorough consideration of this topic is lacking. The purpose of this paper is to give a comprehensive survey of the occurrence of the feeding of one bird by another of a different species and to describe the conditions under which the behavior has tended to occur. The subject is potentially of considerable evolutionary interest since in interspecific helping, kin selection is impossible.

Certain instances have been omitted from the discussion and the list. They include captive and parasitic birds and situations where a clutch has been partially or fully replaced with that of another species by an experimenter. Common names for bird species will be used throughout the paper; a list of scientific names appears in Appendix I.

RESULTS

The list of instances of interspecific feeding shown in Table 1 was compiled by searching the literature (Appendix II) and requests made through several ornithological journals. Table 1 summarizes 140 cases of interspecific feeding. Adopting species are represented by 22 families and 65 species, and birds that were fed by 22 families and 71 species (Tables 2, 3). There were 95 cases of nestlings fed, 30 cases of fledglings, 11 cases of both nestlings and fledglings, and 4 cases where no age was given.

I have classified instances of interspecific feeding into 8 categories related to their probable proximate causes (Table 2): (1) for some reason, the bird was raising a mixed clutch; (2) the original nest and brood of the bird were destroyed; (3) the nest of another species was very close to that of the bird performing the behavior; (4) young birds calling stimulated another species to feed them; (5) orphaned birds were adopted temporarily or permanently; (6) a male bird fed another species while his mate incubated; (7) finding a mateless bird, or being mateless itself, a bird joined a heterospecific individual or pair with young; (8) a miscellaneous category: none of the above reasons were evident. Not all of the categories are mutually exclusive.

Mixed clutches.—Mixed clutches have been frequently observed, especially among hole-nesting species when competition for nesting sites is severe. Mackenzie (1954) deliberately removed half of 60 boxes in an area during the fall in an attempt to study effects of competition on cavity-nesters. The following spring, a Redstart presumably laid eggs in 2 tits' nests. The Great Tit and Coal Tit parents raised the young Redstarts along with their own. Great Tits have been thought to usurp Blue

pter.
ğ
ž
ا <u>></u> 0
fami
ģ
arranged l
birds,
g among
feeding
of interspecific
jo
occurrences of
$_{\rm of}$
A list
_:
LABLE

Species involved ^a GAVIIDAE	Proximate reason	Age of birds fed ^b	Sex of feeding bird ^e	Source
	close nest	ÍT.	В	Abraham 1978
	close nest	Z	ĭτ	Gammon pers. comm.
	mixed clutch	В	В	Sumner 1933
Mourning Dove—White-winged Dove	misc.	Z	Ţ	Neff 1945
	mixed clutch	Z	ഥ	Raney 1939
	nest lost	Z	F	Lyon 1922
Great Horned Owl—Red-tailed Hawk	misc.	Z	দ	Hovingh and Ponshair 1951
Green Violet-ear—White-eared Hummingbird	unknown	ח	Ω	Wagner in Skutch 1976
Red-bellied Woodpecker—Tufted Tit- mouse	calling young	[I-	n	Curry 1969
	calling young	(I-	M	Davis 1973
Northern Three-toed Woodpecker— Black-backed Three-toed Woodpecker	calling young, mateless	Z	Ħ	Hickey pers. comm.
	misc.	Z	F	Lott 1939

Table 1. Continued.

Source	Deck 1945	Lowther 1975	Bragg 1968	Snyder 1973	Burgess 1964		Chapman 1955	Munro 1929	Brown 1977b	Van Velzen 1960		Pike 1930	Lack 1953		Wight 1934	Pullman 1970	Robinson 1962	Pike 1932	Heaven in Armstrong	Betts 1958
Sex of feeding bird ^c	ĹŦ	n	ų	Ω	Ω		В	M	M	В		Ω	В		M	n	Ω	Ω	Ω	Ω
Age of birds fed ^b	Z	Z	В	Z	z		Z	Z	Ţ	Z		Z	Z		Z	Z	В	Ŧ	Ţ	Z
Proximate reason	Sim.	close nest	misc.	calling young, orphan	close nest		mixed clutch	close nest	misc.	misc.		close nest	mixed clutch		close nest, mate incu- bating	misc.	misc.	misc.	close nest	misc.
Species involved ^a	TYRANNIDAE Fastern Phoebe—Tree Swallow	Scissor-tailed Flycatcher—Common Grackle	Eastern Kingbird—Northern Oriole	Eastern Wood Pewee—Eastern Kingbird	Least Flycatcher—Chipping Sparrow	HIRUNDINIDAE	Tree Swallow—Eastern Bluebird	Tree Swallow—American Robin	Purple Martin—House Sparrow	Purple Martin—Starling	MOTACILLIDAE	Gray Wagtail—Song Thrush	Pied Wagtail—Robin	TROGLODYTIDAE	Carolina Wren—Great Crested Flycatcher	Carolina Wren—Tufted Titmouse	Winter Wren—Townsend's Solitaire	Wren—Willow Warbler	Wren—Spotted Flycatcher	Wren—Coal Tit

TABLE 1. Continued.

Species involved ^a	Proximate reason	Age of birds fed ^b	Sex of feeding bird c	Source
Wren—Great Tit	close nest, mate incu-	Z	M	Heybroek in Armstrong 1955
Wren—Blue Tit	misc.	Z	n	Armstrong and Whitehouse 1977
Wren—Linnet	close nest	z	В	Steiniger <i>in</i> Armstrong 1955
House Wren—Common Flicker	close nest, mate incu- bating	z	M	Royall and Pillmore 1968
House Wren—Black-headed Grosbeak and House Sparrow MIMIDAE	mateless	В	Σ	Hills 1924
Gray Catbird—Common Flicker	orphan	Z	Ω	Hayward 1937
Gray Catbird—House Wren	misc.	Z	ĬΨ	Nolan and Schneider 1962
Gray Catbird—American Robin	mixed clutch	Z	Ľ	Benton 1961
Gray Catbird—Cardinal	mixed clutch	Z	ŢŦ	Brooks 1922
MUSCICAPIDAE				
Robin—Pied Wagtail	mixed clutch	Z	В	Lack 1953
Robin-Wren	misc.	ĹΉ	В	Lack 1953
Robin—Wren	misc.	Z	Ω	Duval in Armstrong 1955
Robin—Wren	misc.	ĺΞ	í±,	Eckermann in Armstrong 1955
Robin—Blackbird	mate incubating, orphan	Z	M	Armstrong and Whitehouse 1977
Robin—Blackbird	misc.	Ŧ.	В	Lack 1953

Table 1. Continued.

Species involved ^a	Proximate reason	Age of birds fed ^b	Sex of feeding bird ^c	Source
Robin—Song Thrush	nest lost	Z	В	Lack 1953
Redstart—Pied Flycatcher	mixed clutch	Z	В	Amann <i>in</i> Mackenzie 1954
Redstart—Great Tit	mixed clutch	Z	В	Amann <i>in</i> Mackenzie 1954
Eastern Bluebird—House Wren	close nest, mate incu- bating	Z	M	Forbush 1929
Eastern Bluebird—House Wren	close nest	Z	M	Batts 1958
Eastern Bluebird—Mockingbird	misc.	В	В	Carr and Goin 1965
Eastern Bluebird-Mountain Bluebird	mateless	Z	M	Scott 1971
Swainson's Thrush—American Robin	calling young	Z	Ω	Jewett 1928
Blackbird—Pied Wagtail	calling young	H	M	Russell 1973
Blackbird—Robin	misc.	Ή	ų	Lack 1953
Blackbird—Song Thrush	mateless	В	M	Moore 1973
American Robin-Mourning Dove	mixed clutch	Z	Ţ	Raney 1939
American Robin—Gray Catbird	close nest	Z	В	Wetherbee 1930
American Robin-Gray Catbird	mixed clutch	Z	ī	Benton 1961
	unknown	Ω	Ω	Warren 1930
American Robin—House Finch	close nest	z	В	Henderson 1925
American Robin—House Finch	mixed clutch	Z	В	Bailey and Niedrach 1936
Tropical Gnatcatcher—Golden-masked Tanager	close nest	Z	Ľ.	Skutch 1960
Karoo Prinia—Layard's Titbabbler	close nest	Z	В	Martin 1968
Spotted Flycatcher—Blackbird	close nest, lost nest	Z	В	Southern 1952

TABLE 1. Continued.

Species involved ^a	Proximate reason	$\begin{array}{c} {\rm Age} \ {\rm of} \\ {\rm birds} \\ {\rm fed}^{\rm b} \end{array}$	Sex of feeding bird ^c	Source
AEGITHALIDAE Long-tailed Tit—Great Tit	mateless	Z	Ω	Possert 1955
PARIDAE Marsh Tit—Coal Tit	mixed clutch	Z	В	Gustavsson <i>in</i> Mackenzie 1954
Marsh Tit—Blue Tit	mixed clutch	Z	В	Amann <i>in</i> Mackenzie 1954
Willow Tit—Blue Tit	mixed clutch	z	В	Amann <i>in</i> Mackenzie 1954
Carolina Chickadee—Eastern Bluebird	mixed clutch	Z	В	Murphy 1968
Mountain Chickadee—Williamson's Sapsucker	close nest, lost nest	Z	В	Russell 1947
Mountain Chickadee—Plain Titmouse	mixed clutch	Z	ĬΉ	Jensen 1925
Coal Tit—Redstart	mixed clutch	Z	В	Mackenzie 1954
Great Tit—Redstart	mixed clutch	Z	В	Mackenzie 1954
Great Tit—Redstart	mixed clutch	Z	В	Amann <i>in</i> Mackenzie 1954
Great Tit—Blue Tit	mixed clutch	Z	В	Mackenzie 1954
Great Tit—Blue Tit	mixed clutch	Z	В	Amann <i>in</i> Mackenzie 1954
Great Tit—Blue Tit	mixed clutch	Z	В	Arn 1955
Great Tit—Blue Tit	mixed clutch	Z	В	Weinzierl 1954
Blue Tit—Wren	misc.	Z	В	Armstrong 1955
Blue Tit—Robin	close nest	Z	В	Lonsdale 1935
Blue Tit—Robin	mixed clutch	Z	H	Lack 1953
		:		

TABLE 1. Continued.

Species involved ^a	Proximate reason	Age of birds fed ^b	Sex of feeding bird ^e	Source
Blue Tit—Redstart	mixed clutch	Z	В	Amann <i>in</i> Mackenzie 1954
Blue Tit—Marsh Tit	mixed clutch	Z	В	Amann <i>in</i> Mackenzie 1954
Blue Tit—Great Tit	mixed clutch	Z	В	Arn 1955
Blue Tit—Treecreeper	close nest	В	M	Antoine 1959
Nuthatch—Great Tit	mived chutch	z	æ	Arn 1955
Nuthatch—Starling	close nest	Z	ı D	Powell 1946
Nuthatch—Starling	close nest	Z	Ω	Svensson 1955
Pygmy Nuthatch—Mountain Bluebird	calling young, close nest	Z	M	Pinkowski pers. comm.
EMBERIZIDAE				
Song Sparrow—House Wren	orphan	Ţ	U	Jackson 1941
Song Sparrow—American Robin	close nest	В	В	Twombly 1934
Song Sparrow—Cardinal	mixed clutch	Z	В	Brackbill 1952
Song Sparrow—Yellow Warbler	close nest	В	В	Jackson 1941
White-throated Sparrow—Dark-eyed Junco	misc.	ÍT.	n	Greenlaw 1977
Dark-eyed Junco—Bewick's Wren	close nest, mate incu- bating	Z	M	Williams 1942
Dusky Seaside Sparrow—Red-winged Blackbird	mateless	Ĺ.	M	Rakestraw pers. comm.
Chipping Sparrow—Purple Finch	close nest, orphan	Ŧ	В	Jackson 1941
Field Sparrow—Rufous-sided Towhee	close nest	z	U	Hoyt 1948

Table 1. Continued.

Species involved ^a Rufous-sided Towhee—Mockingbird	Proximate reason	Age of birds fed ^b	Sex of feeding bird ^c F	Source Westwood 1946
	close nest	Z	M	Hoyt 1948
	misc.	F	Ţ	Wright 1956
	misc.	ম	В	Olendorff 1974
_	misc.	ī	n	Sutton 1968
-	misc.	Ħ	M	Antevs 1947
S	calling young	z	M	Thaxter 1930
Ü	calling young	ŢŦ	M	Warriner 1937
ol	lost nest, mate incu- bating	ĹŦ	M	Logan 1951
Ē	mixed clutch	z	В	Brackbill 1952
clo	close nest	Z	M	Nolan 1965
Ë	mate incubating	Z	M	Hales 1896
.m	misc.	ĹΉ	M	Skutch 1976
un	unknown	n	ĮT.	Skutch 1961
-	nedano panos pail	[±	~	Kendeigh 1945
misc.	misc.	Z	M	Re a 1945
misc.	sc.	Z	D	Saunders 1918
Ca	calling young, close nest	z	[**	Lawrence 1948
ç	close nest	Z	В	Allen in Williams 1942
Ε	mateless	Z	U	Maciula 1960

Table 1. Continued.

Worm-eating Warbler—Kentucky War-bler calling young F U Hickey pers. comm. bler Prothonotary Warbler—Pine Warbler misc. B U Beck 1925 Common Grackle—Chipping Sparrow misc. B U Baillairge 1930 Common Grackle—Chipping Sparrow calling young F M Mountfort 1957 House Finch—American Robin misc. N B Bailey and Niedrach 1936 House Finch—American Robin misc. N B Bailey and Niedrach 1936 House Finch—American Robin misc. N B Bailey and Niedrach 1936 House Sparrow—Eastern Kingbird misc. N D Porcher pers. comm. House Sparrow—Life Swallow misc. N D Porcher pers. comm. House Sparrow—House Sparrow—Hedge Sparrow calling young, close N F Porcher pers. comm. House Sparrow—Sparrow—Sparrow—Sparrow—Sparrow—Sparrow—Sparrow—Sparrow—Sparrow—Sparrow—Wed-eyed Virco misc. N D Breek 1925 House Sparrow—Sparrow—Red-eyed Virco misc. N	Species involved ^a	Proximate reason	Age of birds fed ^b	Sex of feeding bird ^c	Source
Chler—Pine Warbler misc. F U LDAE misc. B U LLIDAE calling young F M nich misc dutch N B nerican Robin misc. N B nerican Robin misc. F F Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Eastern Kingbird misc. N U Cliff Swallow close nest N F Cliff Swallow close nest N F Hedge Sparrow calling young, close N F Hadge Sparrow misc. F F Spotted Flycatcher misc. N F Spotted Flycatcher misc. N U Secino misc. N U Serin N F Serin N F Ferry F F F F F N	Worm-eating Warbler—Kentucky War- bler	calling young	Ŧ	n	Hickey pers. comm.
Hated Flycatcher Robins and a calling young sparrow misc. Eastern Kingbird misc. Cliff Swallow close nest No Cliff Swallow calling young, close of the Calling young, cl	Prothonotary Warbler—Pine Warbler	misc.	Ħ	U	Beck 1925
—Chipping Sparrowmisc.BUILLIDAEcalling youngFMnerican Robinmixed clutchNBnerican Robinmisc.FFEastern Kingbirdmisc.FFEastern Kingbirdmisc.FFEastern Kingbirdmisc.FFHedge Sparrowclose nestNCCliff Swallowclose nestNFHedge Sparrowmisc.FFBlackbirdmisc.FFTufted Titmousecalling young, closeNFSpotted Flycatchermisc.NCNWarblermisc.NUSerinnisc.NF	ICTERIDAE				
ILLIDAE calling young F M nerican Robin mixed clutch N B nerican Robin misc. N B nerican Robin misc. F F Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Cliff Swallow close nest N U Cliff Swallow close nest N F Hedge Sparrow calling young B F Blackbird misc. N F Tufted Titmouse calling young, close N F Spotted Flycatcher misc. N U Need-eyed Vireo misc. N U Serin N F	Common Grackle—Chipping Sparrow	misc.	В	U	Baillairge 1930
inch calling young F M nerican Robin mixed clutch N B nerican Robin misc. F F Hastern Kingbird misc. F F Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Tree Swallow close nest N U Cliff Swallow close nest N F Hedge Sparrow calling young B F Blackbird misc. F Tufted Titmouse calling young, close N F Spotted Flycatcher misc. N U Need-eyed Vireo misc. N U Serin misc. N F	FRINGILLIDAE				
nerican Robin mixed clutch N B nerican Robin misc. N B IDAE Feastern Kingbird F F Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Tree Swallow misc. N U Cliff Swallow close nest N F Hedge Sparrow calling young B F Blackbird misc. N F Tufted Titmouse calling young, close N F Spotted Flycatcher misc. N D Need-eyed Vireo misc. N U Serin N F	Chaffinch—Hawfinch	calling young	Ŧ	M	Mountfort 1957
IDAE N B Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Tree Swallow close nest N F Hedge Sparrow calling young B F Blackbird misc. F F Tufted Titmouse calling young, close N F Spotted Flycatcher misc. N C Spotted Flycatcher misc. N U Red-eyed Vireo misc. N C Serin misc. N F	House Finch—American Robin	mixed clutch	Z	В	Bailey and Niedrach 1936
IDAE misc. F F Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Eastern Kingbird misc. N U Tree Swallow close nest N F Hedge Sparrow calling young B F Blackbird F F Tufted Titmouse F F Insect N F Spotted Flycatcher misc. N F Yellow Warbler misc. N U Red-eyed Vireo misc. N F Serin N F	House Finch—American Robin	misc.	Z	В	Bailey and Niedrach 1936
Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Tree Swallow misc. N U Cliff Swallow close nest N F Hedge Sparrow calling young B F Blackbird misc. F Tufted Titmouse nest F Spotted Flycatcher misc. N F Yellow Warbler misc. N U Red-eyed Vireo misc. N F Serin N F	PLOCEIDAE				
Eastern Kingbird misc. F F Tree Swallow misc. N U Cliff Swallow close nest N F Hedge Sparrow calling young B F Blackbird F F Tufted Titmouse N F Spotted Flycatcher misc. N F Yellow Warbler misc. N U Red-eyed Vireo misc. N F Serin N F	House Sparrow—Eastern Kingbird	misc.	ĹŦ,	ΙΉ	Fitch 1949
-Tree Swallow misc. N U -Cliff Swallow close nest N F -Hedge Sparrow calling young B F -Blackbird F F -Tufted Titmouse N F -Spotted Flycatcher misc. N F -Yellow Warbler misc. N U -Red-eyed Vireo misc. N C -Serin misc. N F	House Sparrow—Eastern Kingbird	misc.	Ħ	Ĭ±,	Hamilton 1952
Cliff Swallow close nest N F -Hedge Sparrow calling young B F -Blackbird F F -Tufted Titmouse rest N F -Spotted Flycatcher misc. N F -Yellow Warbler misc. N U -Red-eyed Vireo misc. N F -Serin misc. N F	House Sparrow—Tree Swallow	misc.	Z	n	Porcher pers. comm.
-Hedge Sparrow calling young, close F F -Blackbird F F F -Tufted Titmouse calling young, close N F -Spotted Flycatcher misc. N F -Yellow Warbler misc. N U -Red-eyed Vireo misc. N F -Serin misc. N F	House Sparrow—Cliff Swallow	close nest	Z	Ţ	Hofman pers. comm.
-Blackbird misc. F F -Tufted Titmouse calling young, close N F -Spotted Flycatcher misc. N F -Yellow Warbler misc. N U -Red-eyed Vireo misc. N F -Serin Misc. N F	House Sparrow—Hedge Sparrow	calling young	В	ΙΉ	Brindley 1937
-Tufted Titmouse calling young, close N F nest nest nest N F -Spotted Flycatcher misc. N F -Yellow Warbler misc. N U -Red-eyed Virco misc. N F Serin N F	House Sparrow—Blackbird	misc.	Ŧ	Ţ	Parker 1973
Spotted Flycatcher misc. N F -Yellow Warbler misc. N U -Red-eyed Virco misc. N F -Serin N F	House Sparrow—Tufted Titmouse	calling young, close nest	Z	íz.	Prescott 1967
-Yellow Warbler misc. N U -Red-eyed Vireo misc. N U -Serin N F	House Sparrow—Spotted Flycatcher	misc.	Z	ΙΉ	Powell 1927
-Red-eyed Vireo misc. N U Serin misc. N F	House Sparrow—Yellow Warbler	misc.	Z	n	Brewer pers. comm.
-Serin misc. N F	House Sparrow—Red-eyed Vireo	misc.	Z	n	Austin 1958
	House Sparrow—Serin	misc.	Z	F	Hoehl 1940

Table 1. Continued.

		Age of	Sex of	
		bjrds	feeding	
Species involved ^a	Proximate reason	fed ^b	$\operatorname{bird}^{\mathrm{c}}$	Source
STURNIDAE				
Starling—Common Flicker	close nest	Z	В	Prescott 1971
Starling—Purple Martin	lost nest	Z	U	Brown 1977a
Starling—American Robin	lost nest	Z	В	Putnam 1961
Starling—American Robin	misc.	Z	D	Herbert 1971

 $[^]a$ First species listed fed second species. b F = fledgling, N = nestling, B = both nestling and fledgling, U = unknown age. c Under Sex of Feeding Bird: F = female, M = male, U = unknown, B = both sexes.

<u></u>	<u>-</u>	
Reason	No. of cases	Percenta
Mixed clutch	32	21.2
Original nest destroyed	7	4.6
Close nest of another species	36	23.8
	15	9.9
Calling by young Orphaned birds	6	4.0
Mateless birds	7	4.6
Male, mate incubating	8	5.3
Miscellaneous	40	26.5

Table 2. Incidence of proximate reasons for interspecific feeding.

Tit nests (Arn 1955, Weinzierl 1958). Occasionally, Great Tits have laid in other nests, including those of the Blue Tit and Nuthatch (Arn 1955).

Amann (1949) found a number of similar cases in previous years. Gustavsson (*in* Mackenzie 1954) found a banded Coal Tit and banded Marsh Tit had laid in the same nest; the Marsh Tits ended up raising a mixed clutch of 4 Marsh Tits and 2 Coal Tits. It was unclear whether the Marsh Tits ousted the originally nesting Coal Tits, or the Coal Tits deserted or were killed and the Marsh Tits took over the nest.

At least 3 cases of American Robins sharing a nest with another species have been observed: with a Mourning Dove (Raney 1939); with a Gray Catbird (Benton 1961); and with a House Finch (Bailey and Niedrach 1936). A Robin shared a nest with a Pied Wagtail (Lack 1953), and a Cardinal and Song Sparrow raised a combined brood (Brackbill 1952).

Nest or brood destroyed.—There are several instances of birds feeding another species after their own nest was destroyed. In one, a pair of Robins fed Song Thrushes (Lack 1953). Southern (1952) observed a pair of Spotted Flycatchers feeding Blackbirds after their nest was destroyed in a storm. After a pair of Starlings repeatedly lost a nest placed on a drainspout, they fed nearby nestling American Robins (Putnam 1961). A male Cardinal fed American Robins after his first nest was destroyed and while his mate incubated their second clutch (Logan 1951). Song Sparrows fed Yellow Warblers while nearby there was a Song Sparrow nest with dead young in it, presumably belonging to this pair (Jackson 1941).

When a researcher took the eggs of a Screech Owl, the owl brooded flickers in a hole in the same tree, and even brought a small bird for the nestlings to eat (Lyon 1922). A Starling fed nestling Purple Martins after 4 Starling eggs were taken from the martin-house and destroyed (Brown 1977a). This category is probably larger than it appears. In many observations, summarized later, the nesting history of the birds performing the behavior was unknown.

Close nesting of another species.—There are many examples of 2 species nesting close to each other and one or both taking an interest in the nest of the other. In some cases, a pair has attacked another species

^a Percentages reflect reasons cited; in some cases more than one reason was given.

bringing food to their nestlings; at other times the pairs took turns feeding all young with no antagonism.

It is not known how frequently a nest might fail due to one or both parents neglecting it for another nest. A male Pygmy Nuthatch fed nestling Mountain Bluebirds in a nest .5 m above his own; his own nest failed as he was attracted to the bluebirds calling before his eggs hatched (Pinkowski pers. comm.). A male Eastern Bluebird fed nestling House Wrens as his mate incubated and later neglected his own young; he even fought the wren parents to feed the young birds (Forbush 1929).

A pair of Arctic Loons raised a brood of 5 Spectacled Eiders (Abraham 1978). Initial observations included the locating of the loon and duck nests 10 m apart. One month later, the ducks were being fed by the loons, although Spectacled Eiders are self-sufficient upon hatching.

The fate of the original loon nest was not known.

The timing of the hatching of the 2 nests seems to be a critical factor. If 2 pairs of birds nest close to each other, the nestlings that hatch first may receive the attention of one or both of the birds of the other pair. This was the case when a male Tree Swallow was observed feeding young American Robins in a nest atop the house in which his own nest was located (Munro 1929). The nestling swallows were about 1 week younger than the robins. Males will sometimes feed at another nest while their own nest is being incubated. A House Wren fed nestling Common Flickers while his mate incubated and continued to do so after his own eggs hatched (Royall and Pillmore 1968) and a Wren fed Great Tits under similar circumstances (Armstrong 1955). This will be discussed further in a separate category.

In one sense, the fact that one nest is close to another cannot be considered a reason for the interspecific feeding behavior since in any given area, there will always be a number of species nesting close to each other. Only those instances are cited where the original author believed it significant enough to mention. Its importance is due to the fact that it indicates that the bird is breeding; in some cases individuals perform-

ing the behavior may not be.

Young birds calling as a stimulus.—In certain cases of interspecific feeding, the observers believed the calls of the young were an important factor triggering the behavior. In some cases, fledglings or nestlings were fed as another bird was foraging nearby. Fledglings have directly solicited food from adults of a different species. A Tufted Titmouse begged and ran toward a Red-bellied Woodpecker, which fed it (Curry 1969). While a male Hairy Woodpecker was feeding at a suet holder, an immature Downy Woodpecker called for food and was fed by the Hairy (Davis 1973). A fledgling Pied Wagtail chased a Blackbird and the Blackbird fed it 6–7 times (Russell 1973). A Worm-eating Warbler fed a fledgling Kentucky Warbler as it called from the ground (Hickey pers. comm.).

Of course, when a nest of one species is near the nest of a second (as in the preceding category), the visual and auditory signals could together trigger food-bringing behavior. Begging by nestlings must rarely elicit feeding by heterospecific birds, based on the scarcity of such observations in the many published studies of nesting behavior. Studies of the feeding of fledglings are much rarer, so it is uncertain whether feeding of fledged young is a rare event. It is not likely that unsuccessful panhandling attempts will be reported in the literature; however, they do occur. Brewer (pers. comm.) saw a fledgling Yellow Warbler beg from a female House Sparrow, which pecked at it.

Orphaned birds.—In several cases, one species has brought food to orphaned broods or individuals of another species. This could be triggered by the presumably loud calling of unsatiated youngsters. Snyder (1913) noticed a brood of Eastern Kingbirds calling loudly after an electrical storm. The parents were not seen afterward. An Eastern Wood Pewee fed the orphans for 10 days, until they fledged. A male Robin fed motherless Blackbirds while his mate was incubating, after which the male Blackbird deserted the nest. The Blackbirds fledged under the Robin's care (Armstrong and Whitehouse 1977). Black-and-white Warblers fed an Ovenbird fledgling which had become separated from its parents (Kendeigh 1945). A pair of Chipping Sparrows fed a brood of fledgling Purple Finches while continuing to feed their own brood in a nest in a small spruce one tier of branches below the finch nest (Jackson 1941).

Male feeding another species while mate incubates.—Two previous sections include several cases of males feeding nestlings of another species while their mates were incubating. Wight (1934) noted a Carolina Wren feeding Great Crested Flycatchers for a short time, although after a few fights with the parents, the wren gave up the attempt. A male Scarlet Tanager fed Chipping Sparrows before his own eggs hatched (Hales 1896), and a Dark-eyed Junco fed Bewick's Wrens as his mate incubated (Lonsdale 1935).

Skutch (1961) noted certain males are so eager to begin feeding their nestlings that they offer food to the unhatched eggs. He suggested that feeding of another species "may provide an outlet for repressed energy."

Mateless birds.—A few cases of interspecific feeding have been documented that involved a bird that had been unsuccessful in finding a mate, or had joined a parent bird whose mate had disappeared. A female Northern Three-toed Woodpecker, out of the known breeding range of this species, fed nestling Black-backed Three-toed Woodpeckers while they called loudly from the nest (Hickey pers. comm.). After several days of observation, Possert (1955) concluded that only 2 birds were attending a Great Tits' nest, a male Great Tit and a Long-tailed Tit. A male House Wren that could not secure a mate, although he had filled a birdhouse with nesting material, fed 3 Black-headed Grosbeaks until they fledged, and then fed nestling House Sparrows (Hills 1924). A male Blackbird fed 2 nestling Song Thrushes, assisting the female thrush; the nestlings fledged and were observed for several days with the Blackbird (Moore 1973). A banded male Dusky Seaside Sparrow that had bred successfully in previous years, could not locate a mate due to a lack

of females (Rakestraw pers. comm). (At that time there was only one female in the entire area of St. John's National Wildlife Refuge near Titusville, Florida.) It fed 2 fledgling Red-winged Blackbirds for 4 days. A male Eastern Bluebird joined a Mountain Bluebird who had lost her mate and helped her raise her brood (Scott 1971). A Worm-eating Warbler fed nestling Ovenbirds at a nest where only one parent Ovenbird was observed (Maciula 1960).

Miscellaneous category.—This is a large category (Table 2) but may only appear so due to omissions in either observations or records of observers. There are, nevertheless, some unusual circumstances surrounding

certain instances of interspecific feeding in this category.

Under the category of mixed clutches, it was mentioned that some birds are thought to usurp nests, in some cases with a partial clutch, especially in cases of severe competition for nest sites. Hovingh and Ponshair (1951) cited this as a possible reason for a Great Horned Owl raising a brood of 3 Red-tailed Hawks. A female Common Flicker may have usurped a Starling nest, as she was observed caring for 3 nestling Starlings in what appeared to be a typical Starling nest (Lott 1939). A Mourning Dove, whose own eggs failed to hatch, began to care for a brood of White-winged Doves, who had been neglected by their own parents (Neff 1945).

Perhaps one of the most unusual cases is that of a female Blackbird that, after rearing her own young, continued to offer food for 2–3 weeks to any bird coming near. A Robin accepted the food (Lack 1953).

Taxonomic and ecological distribution.—Of the 65 species that were observed feeding another species, 25 have multiple records (Table 3). The highest number of observations for a species was 10, for the House Sparrow, although it was observed only twice to be fed by another species. Of species that were fed, there are multiple records for 29. Most frequently observed was the American Robin, with 11 records. The 22 families of birds fed are listed in Table 4.

There are 4 instances of one species feeding another, with the reverse situation also being observed. These species pairs are (excluding cases of mixed clutches) Common Flicker—Starling, Purple Martin—Starling, Robin—Blackbird, and American Robin—House Finch.

Comparisons by habitat, diet, and type of nest, indicate similarities between "adopters" and species being fed (Table 5). Edge species were most often observed. This is likely due to the nature of the observations, many made by suburban backyard birdwatchers. Of 8 cases of warblers feeding another species, 5 were ground-nesters. Perhaps the list of observations reflects birds that are most easily seen, and implies the possibility of other, not so visible species, being just as likely to engage in the behavior.

DISCUSSION

The interspecific feeding observed as a result of mixed clutches cannot be considered in the same way as under the other conditions. Peek et al. (1972) have shown that Red-winged Blackbirds do not appear to

TABLE 3. Species with multiple records.

	No. o	f cases
Species	Adoptors	Birds fed
Red-tailed Hawk	0	2
Mourning Dove	2	0
Common Flicker	0	4
Eastern Kingbird	0	3
Tree Swallow	2	2
Purple Martin	2	0
Pied Wagtail	0	2
Carolina Wren	2	0
Winter Wren, Wren	7	4
House Wren	2	4
Gray Catbird	$\overline{4}$	3
Mockingbird	0	2
Robin	7	$\frac{-}{4}$
Redstart	$\overset{\cdot}{2}$	$\overline{4}$
Eastern Bluebird	$\frac{1}{4}$	î
Mountain Bluebird	Ô	$\overset{1}{2}$
Blackbird	3	5
Song Thrush	Ö	2
American Robin	6	11
Spotted Flycatcher	Ö	2
Marsh Tit	$\overset{\circ}{2}$	0
Mountain Chickadee	$\frac{1}{2}$	ŏ
Coal Tit	0	$\overset{\circ}{2}$
Great Tit	$\overset{o}{6}$	5
Blue Tit	7	7
Tufted Titmouse	ó	3
Nuthatch	3	0
Song Sparrow	4	0
Dark-eyed Junco	0	$\frac{0}{2}$
	0	3
Chipping Sparrow Field Sparrow	0	3
Rufous-sided Towhee	4	0
Brown Towhee	2	0
Cardinal	4	3
	2	0
Black-and-white Warbler		
Yellow Warbler	0	2
Ovenbird	0	2
Worm-eating Warbler	2	0
House Finch	0	3
House Sparrow	10	2
Starling		_4
Total number of species with multiple records	25	29

recognize their own young either in or out of the nest until they are 10 days old. In 2 of 3 albatross species, parents did not appear to recognize a strange chick put into their nests to replace one of their own chicks (Tickell and Pindar 1972). Since the chicks rarely leave their own nests, there seems to be no advantage in learning to recognize a bird's own

TABLE 4. Families of adoptors and birds fed, and number of species for each.

<u>-</u>	 	
Family	No. of adopting species	No. of species of birds fed
Gaviidae	1	0
Anatidae	0	1
Accipitridae	1	1
Falconidae	1	0
Columbidae	1	2
Strigidae	2	1
Trochilidae	1	1
Picidae	4	4
Tyrannidae	5	2
Hirundinidae	2	3
Motacillidae	2	1
Troglodytidae	2 3	3
Mimidae	1	4
Prunellidae	0	1
Muscicapidae	9	13
Aegithalidae	1	0
Paridae	7	6
Certhiidae	0	1
Sittidae	2	0
Emberizidae	11	9
Parulidae	6	7
Vireonidae	0	1
Icteridae	1	3
Fringillidae	2	5
Ploceidae	1	1
Sturnidae	1	1
Total number of species	65	71

young until later, perhaps upon fledging. This idea is supported in a study of factors relating to the timing of parent-chick recognition in swallows (Burtt 1977). Birds may feed almost anything that happens to be in their nests under the right conditions. It is of interest that birds fed and, in some cases, successfully reared another species in their own nests, but it does not explain spontaneous interspecific feeding.

Because there are so many cases of what seems to be an unusual and not easily observed phenomenon, especially for fledglings, it would appear the behavior requires an evolutionary explanation. One possibility is that the behavior is non-adaptive, and a consequence of other adaptive features. For example, it may be ordinarily advantageous to have such a strong drive to care for young that it overcomes heavy deterrents. If this is so, feeding inappropriate young may be rare enough, and carry a small enough penalty, that no evolutionary modification of the strong drive occurs.

Arguing against this possibility is the fact that it is difficult to provoke the feeding of alien young in any fashion except by placing them in the parental nest. When parent swallows begin actively to discriminate their

Table 5. Number of species of adoptors and birds fed, according to habitat, diet, and type of nest.

	No. of adopting species	No. of species of birds fed
Habitat		
Edge	41	50
Forest	19	17
Water	3	2
Grass	2	1
Desert	0	1
Primary Diet		
Insectivorous	45	51
Granivorous	13	16
Other	7	4
Type of Nest		
Open	39	45
Cavity	26	26

own young from others (upon fledging) they are aggressive to alien chicks (Burtt 1977).

Dawkins (1976) suggested that adoption should be a rare mistake, since it confers no benefits upon the foster parents, but instead wastes time and energy that could be invested in their own kin. He did, however, allow that adoptors could benefit by gaining practice in the "art of childrearing." From this hypothesis, one would predict younger birds to be more likely to engage in interspecific feeding than older birds, since the experience they would gain by the feeding practice would directly benefit them and enable them to be better parents.

That experience does improve nesting success is suggested by a study conducted by DeStevens (1978). She found that younger female Tree Swallows have lower fledging rates for their broods than older female Tree Swallows. Lehrman and Wortis (1967) presented conclusive evidence of experience improving parental care in Ringed Turtle Doves, and a number of similar observations support this idea as well (Hediger 1950, 1955, Lehrman 1961).

In most cases of interspecific feeding, the age of the helper is, unfortunately, unknown. Porcher (pers. comm.) mentioned a case of a juvenile House Sparrow feeding nestling Tree Swallows. He observed older sparrows being driven off by swallows, and believed the young sparrow was allowed to approach the nest because it was not yet mature. Several cases report definitely older, experienced birds feeding another species. Rakestraw's (pers. comm.) observation of the Dusky Seaside Sparrow that had bred successfully in previous years is a case in point. The bird had had ample experience in raising young. The male Blackbird who assisted a mateless Song Thrush was "mature" (Moore 1973).

It may be more advantageous for a young bird to feed another species

than not to engage in the feeding behavior at all if experience improves an organism's parental abilities. In certain cases, this might be especially true, for example, when a bird's own nest failed and it was too late for it to renest, or when it's own mate had been lost and it could not readily find another, or when a male bird, possibly inexperienced, has time to practice on its neighbors' offspring while his mate incubates. Other hypotheses explaining interspecific feeding are conceivable, such as reciprocal altruism (Trivers 1971), but the currently available information seems not to provide any ready way of approaching them.

Although accepting food no matter who the donor is should be advantageous in most circumstances, being raised by foster parents may lead to later problems. When a pair of Common Terns raised a Herring Gull, it did not behave as a normal gull (Kuhlemann 1939). A Mourning Dove remained with its foster family of Ringed Turtle Doves rather than joining its own species (Grewe 1959). Female Zebra Finches raised by Bengalese Finches showed no clear preference for their own species in choosing a mate (Sonnemann and Sjölander 1977). Herring and Lesser Black-backed gulls showed abnormal migration and hybridization after cross-fostering experiments (Harris 1970). These types of reactions indicate that cross-fostering may not be totally beneficial to the adopted bird.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I thank the following who contributed observations of interspecific feeding behavior cited in this paper: Ken Gammon, Joseph J. Hickey, D. Edward Hofman, Ben Pinkowski, Alfred G. Porcher, and James L. Rakestraw. I am also very grateful to Richard Brewer who provided the impetus for the paper and also aided in several revisions of the manuscript, and to Richard Pippen and James Erickson whose suggestions were most helpful.

LITERATURE CITED

- ABRAHAM, K. F. 1978. Adoption of Spectacled Eider ducklings by Arctic Loons. Condor 80:339–340.
- AMANN, F. 1949. Junge Kohl- und Blaumeisen im gleichen Nest. Ornithol. Beob. 46: 187–190.
- American Ornithologists' Union. 1957. 5th ed. Lord Baltimore Press, Baltimore, Maryland.
- Antevs, A. 1947. Towhee helps Cardinals feed their fledglings. Condor 49:209.
- Antoine, N. J. 1959. Blue Tit feeding young Treecreepers. Br. Birds 52:432–433. (abstract in Bird-Banding 31:100).
- AOU CHECKLIST OF NORTH AMERICAN BIRDS. 1957. 5th ed. Lord Baltimore Press, Baltimore.
- Armstrong, E. A. 1955. The Wren. Collins, London.
- ——, AND H. L. K. WHITEHOUSE. 1977. Behavioural adaptations of the Wren (*Troglodytes troglodytes*). Biol. Rev. 52:235–294.
- ARN, H. 1955. Mischbruten von Kohlmeisen, Blaumeisen und kleiber. Ornithol. Beob. 52:129. (abstract in Bird-Banding 28:106).
- Austin, O. L. 1958. Life histories of North American cardinals, grosbeaks, buntings, towhees, finches, sparrows and their allies; order Passeriformes, family Fringillidae. U.S. Natl. Mus. Bull. 237.

BAILEY, A. M., AND R. J. NIEDRACH. 1936. Community nesting of Western Robins and House Finches. Condor 38:214.

Baillairge, W. 1930. A Bronzed Grackle foster parent. Can. Field-Nat. 44:166–167.

BATTS, H. L., JR. 1958. The distribution and population of nesting birds on a farm in southern Michigan. Jack-Pine Warbler 36:131-149.

BECK, H. H. 1925. Prothonotary Warbler feeding young of another species. Auk 42: 140.

Benton, A. H. 1961. Nest sharing by robin and catbird. Kingbird 11:81-82.

BETTS, M. M. 1958. The behavior of adult tits toward other birds and mammals near the nest. Br. Birds 51:426-429.

Brackbill, H. 1952. A joint nesting of Cardinals and Song Sparrows. Auk 69:302–307. Bragg, M. B. 1968. Kingbird feeding Baltimore Oriole nestlings. Auk 85:321.

Brindley, M. D. 1937. House Sparrow feeding young Hedge Sparrows. Br. Birds 31:

Brooks, E. 1922. Cardinal and cathird. Bird-Lore 24:343-344.

Brown, C. R. 1977a. Starling feeding Purple Martins. Southwest. Nat. 21:557–558.

-. 1977b. Unusual feeding behavior of a male Purple Martin. Bull. Tex. Ornithol. Soc. 10:15-16.

Burgess, D. D. 1964. Least Flycatcher "assists" at Chipping Sparrow nest. Kingbird 14:

BURTT, E. H. 1977. Some factors in the time of parent-chick recognition in swallows. Anim. Behav. 25:231-239.

CARR, T., AND C. J. GOIN, JR. 1965. Bluebirds feeding Mockingbird nestlings. Wilson Bull. 77:405-407.

CHAPMAN, L. B. 1955. Studies of a Tree Swallow colony (third paper). Bird-Banding 26:45-70.

CURRY, J. R. 1969. Red-bellied Woodpecker feeds Tufted Titmouse. Wilson Bull. 81: 470.

DAVIS, G. L. 1973. Hairy Woodpecker feeding immature Downy Woodpecker. Kingbird 23:189.

DAWKINS, R. 1976. The selfish gene. Oxford Univ. Press, New York.

DECK, R. S. 1945. The neighbor's children. Nature Mag. 38:241-242.

DESTEVENS, D. 1978. The influence of age on the breeding biology of the Tree Swallow Iridoprocne bicolor. Ibis 20:516-523.

Fiтch, H. S. 1949. Sparrow adopts kingbird. Auk 66:368-369.

FORBUSH, E. H. 1929. Birds of Massachusetts and other New England states. Vol. 3. Mass. Dep. Agric., Boston.

Greenlaw, J. S. 1977. White-throated Sparrow as foster parent of fledgling Dark-eyed Junco. Bird-Banding 48:170–171.

Grewe, A. 1959. Ring Doves rear Mourning Dove. Flicker 31:24. HALES, H. 1896. Peculiar traits of some Scarlet Tanagers. Auk 13:261–263.

Hamilton, G. D. 1952. English Sparrow feeding young Eastern Kingbirds. Condor 54: 316.

HARRIS, M. P. 1970. Abnormal immigration and hybridization of Larus argentatus and L. fuscus after interspecific fostering experiments. Ibis 112:488–498.

HAYWARD, W. J. 1937. Incidents in bird behavior. Wilson Bull. 49:47.

Hediger, H. 1950. Wild animals in captivity. Butterworth, London.

-. 1955. Studies of the psychology and behaviour of captive animals in zoos and circuses. Butterworth, London.

Henderson, J. 1925. Robin feeds young House Finch. Auk 42:144.

HERBERT, K. G. S. 1971. Starling feeds young robins. Wilson Bull. 83:316-317.

HILLS, V. G. 1924. A House Wren adopts a family of young Black-headed Grosbeaks. Auk 41:615-616.

HOEHL, O. 1940. Haussperling als Girlitzamme. Beiträge zur Fort-pflanzungsbiologie der Vogel 16:64-65. (abstract in Bird-Banding 19:177).

HOVINGH, P. AND J. PONSHAIR. 1951. Letter to the editor. Jack-Pine Warbler 29:88.

HOYT, J. S. 1948. Observations on nesting associates. Auk 65:188-196.

Jackson, R. E. 1941. Song Sparrows assume role of foster parents. Bull. Mass. Aud. Soc. 25:134–135.

JENSEN, J. K. 1925. Mountain Chickadee with an adopted family. Auk 42:593.

JEWETT, S. G. 1928. Assistant parentage among birds. Condor 30:127-128.

Kendeigh, S. C. 1945. Nesting behavior of wood warblers. Wilson Bull. 57:145–164.

Kuhlemann, P. 1939. Beobechtungen an einer durch Flusseeschwalben (*Sterna hirundo*) aus vertauschtem Ei erbrüteten und aufgezogen Silbermove (*Larus argentatus*). Z. Tierpsychol. 3:75–84.

LACK, D. 1953. The life of the Robin. Penguin Books, London.

LAWRENCE, L. DE K. 1948. A whitethroat trio and a warbler incident. Bird-Banding 19: 122-123.

LEHRMAN, D. S. 1961. Hormonal regulation of parental behavior in birds and infrahuman mammals. Pp. 1268–1382, *in* Sex and Internal Secretion, W. C. Young, ed. 1268–1382. Williams & Wilkins, Baltimore.

——, AND R. P. WORTIS. 1967. Breeding experience and breeding efficiency in the Ring Dove. Anim. Behav. 15:223–228.

Logan, S. 1951. Cardinal, Richmondena cardinalis, assists in feeding robins. Auk 68:516-517.

Lonsdale, W. S. 1935. Blue Tits feeding young Robins. Br. Birds 29:113-114.

LOTT, W. 1939. A flicker with a family of Starlings. Bird-Banding 10:90.

LOWTHER, P. E. 1975. Scissor-tailed Flycatcher feeding Common Grackle young. Kans. Ornithol. Soc. Bull. 26:7.

Lyon, W. I. 1922. Owl kidnaps young flickers. Wilson Bull. 34:230-231.

Maciula, S. J. 1960. Worm-eating Warbler "adopts" Ovenbird nestlings. Auk 77:220.

MACKENZIE, J. M. D. 1954. Redstarts reared in tits' nests. Scot. Nat. 66:146-164.

MARTIN, J. 1968. Karoo Prinias feeding Layard's Tit-babbler. Ostrich 39:263.

Moore, M. 1973. Male Blackbirds (*Turdus merula*) helping to rear young Song Thrushes (*T. philomelos*) Br. Birds 66:365.

MORONY, J. J., W. J. BOCK, AND J. FARRAND, Jr. 1975. Reference list of birds of the world. Am. Mus. Nat. Hist., New York.

MOUNTFORT, G. 1957. The Hawfinch. Collins, London.

Munro, J. A. 1929. Male Tree Swallow feeding nestling robins. Condor 31:75-76.

MURPHY, F. 1968. Chickadees hatch and raise a bluebird. Migrant 39:11-12.

NEFF, J. A. 1945. Foster parentage of a Mourning Dove in the wild. Condor 47:39-40.

Nolan, V., Jr. 1965. A male Cardinal helper at a nest of Yellow-breasted Chats. Wilson Bull. 77:196.

——, AND R. SCHNEIDER. 1962. A catbird helper at a House Wren nest. Wilson Bull. 74:183–184.

OLENDORFF, R. R. 1974. Interspecific feeding of fledgling House Finches by adult Rufous-sided Towhees. Murrelet 55:9.

PARKER, R. 1973. Sparrow feeds young Blackbirds. Bird Life (Oct.-Dec.):31.

PEEK, F. W., E. FRANKS, AND D. CASE. 1972. Recognition of nest, eggs, nest site, and young in female Red-winged Blackbirds. Wilson Bull. 84:243–249.

Peters, J. L. 1931. Check-list of birds of the world. Vol. I. Harvard Univ. Press, Cambridge.

Pike, O. G. 1930. Rambles in Britain's bird-land. London.

——. 1932. The Nightingale: its story and song. Arrowsmith, London.

Possert, A. 1955. Schwanzmeise nilft bei der Aufzucht einer Kohlmeisenbrut. Ornithol. Beob. 52:96. (abstract in Bird-Banding 28:105).

POWELL, F. 1927. House Sparrow feeding nestling Spotted Flycatchers. Br. Birds 21:61.
 POWELL, H. 1946. Nuthatch feeds nestling Starlings. Br. Birds 39:316. (abstract in Ibis 89:152).

Prescott, K. W. 1967. Unusual activities of a House Sparrow and a Blue Jay at a Tufted Titmouse nest. Wilson Bull. 79:346–347.

——. 1971. Unusual activity of Starlings at a Yellow-shafted Flicker nest. Wilson Bull. 83:195–196.

PULLMAN, J. O. 1970. A Tufted Titmouse nest attended by Carolina Chickadees. Chat 34:22.

PUTNAM, W. L. 1961. Starling feeds nestling robins. Can. Field-Nat. 75:52-53.

- RANEY, E. C. 1939. Robin and Mourning Dove use same nest. Auk 56:337-338.
- REA, G. 1945. Black-and-white Warbler feeding young of Worm-eating Warbler. Wilson Bull. 57:262.
- ROBINSON, G. G. 1962. Winter Wren feeds Townsend's Solitaire young. Condor 64:240.
- ROYALL, W. C., Jr., AND R. E. PILLMORE. 1968. House Wren feeds Red-shafted Flicker nestlings. Murrelet 49:4-6.
- Russell, M. 1973. Blackbird feeds wagtail. Bird Life (Oct.-Dec.):31.
- Russell, W. C. 1947. Mountain Chickadee feeding young Williamson's Sapsuckers. Condor 49:83.
- Saunders, A. S. 1918. Blue-winged Warbler feeding a young Field Sparrow. Auk 36:
- Scott, L. 1971. Male Eastern Bluebird assists female Mountain Bluebird in raising young. Blue Jay 29:126-127.
- Skutch, A. F. 1935. Helpers at the nest. Auk 52:257-273.
- -. 1960. Life histories of Central American birds. II. Pac. Coast Avif. No. 34:1-593.
- —. 1961. Helpers among birds. Condor 63:198–226.
- ——. 1976. Parent birds and their young. Univ. of Texas Press, Austin.
- SNYDER, W. E. 1913. The wood pewee as a foster parent. Auk 30:273. SONNEMANN, P., AND S. SJÖLANDER. 1977. Effects of cross-fostering on the sexual imprinting of the female Zebra Finch (Taeniopygia guttata). Z. Tierpsychol. 45:337–348. (abstract in Bird-Banding 49:289).
- SOUTHERN, J. 1952. Spotted Flycatchers feeding nestling Blackbirds. Br. Birds 45:366.
- SUMNER, F. A. 1933. Young Sparrow Hawks and a Screech Owl in the same nest. Condor 35:231–232.
- Sutton, G. M. 1968. Young Curve-billed Thrasher attended by Brown Towhee. Auk 85:127-128.
- Svensson, S. 1955. Nötväcka (Sitta europaea) sommatur Starungar (Sturnus vulgaris). Vår Fågelvårld 14:256. (abstract in Bird-Banding 27:140.)
- THAXTER, B. A. 1930. Father towhee adopts a family. Yosemite Nature Notes 9:88.
- TICKELL, W. L. N., AND R. PINDER. 1972. Chick recognition by albatrosses. Ibis 114:543–
- Trivers, R. L. 1971. The evolution of reciprocal altruism. Q. Rev. Biol. 46:35-57.
- Twombly, F. D. 1934. "Believe it or not." Bird-Lore 36:303.
- VAN VELZEN, W. T. 1960. Starlings fed by Purple Martins. Auk 77:477.
- WARREN, H. M. 1930. The foster mothering of young birds. Bird-Lore 32:198.
- WARRINER, B. R. 1937. Cardinal feeds a young cathird. Migrant 8:62.
- Weinzierl, H. 1958. Zwei weitere Falle von Mischbruten der Kohlund Blaumeise. Ornithol. Mitt. 10:31. (abstract in Bird-Banding 29:196).
- Westwood, R. W. 1946. Contents noted. Nature Mag. 39:399.
- WETHERBEE, Mrs. K. B. 1930. Cooperative parents. Bird-Lore 32:202.
- Wight, E. M. 1934. Attracting birds at Chattanooga. Migrant 5:46.
- WILLIAMS, L. 1942. Interrelations in a nesting group of four species of birds. Wilson Bull. 54:238-249.
- WRIGHT, H. 1956. Towhee feeding behavior. Ala. Birdlife 4:27.
- Biology Department, Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, Michigan 49008. Present address: 2833 Spring Dr., Fremont, Michigan 49412. Received 20 Jul. 1981; accepted 26 Mar. 1982.

APPENDIX I. Common¹ and scientific names of avian species mentioned in paper and list arranged in taxonomic sequence (Morony et al. 1975).

Common name	Scientific name
Arctic Loon	Gavia arctica
Spectacled Eider	Somateria fischeri
Goshawk	Accipiter gentilis
Red-tailed Hawk	Buteo jamaicensis
American Kestrel	Falco sparverius
Herring Gull	Larus argentatus
Lesser Black-backed Gull	Larus fuscus
Common Tern	Sterna hirundo
Ringed Turtle Dove	Streptopelia risoria
Mourning Dove	Zenaida macroura
White-winged Dove	Zenaida asiatica
Screech Owl	Otus asio
Great Horned Owl	Bubo virginianus
Green Violet-ear	Colibri thalassinus
White-eared Hummingbird	Hylocharis leucotis
Red-bellied Woodpecker	Melanerpes carolinus
Williamson's Sapsucker	Sphyrapicus thyroideus
Downy Woodpecker	Picoides pubescens
Hairy Woodpecker	Picoides villosus
Northern Three-toed Woodpecker	Picoides tridactylus
Black-backed Three-toed Woodpecker	Picoides arcticus
Common Flicker	Colaptes auratus
Eastern Phoebe	Sayornis phoebe
Scissor-tailed Flycatcher	Muscivora forficata
Eastern Kingbird	Tyrannus tyrannus
Great Crested Flycatcher	Myiarchus crinitus
Eastern Wood Pewee	Contopus virens
Least Flycatcher	Empidonax minimus
Tree Swallow	Tachycineta bicolor
Purple Martin	Progne subis
Cliff Swallow	Petrochelidon pyrrhonota
Gray Wagtail	Motacilla cinerea
Pied Wagtail	Motacilla alba
Bewick's Wren	Thryomanes bewickii
Carolina Wren	Thryothorus ludovicianus
Winter Wren, Wren	Troglodytes troglodytes
House Wren	Troglodytes aedon
Gray Catbird	Dumetella carolinensis
Mockingbird	Mimus polyglottos
Brown Thrasher	Toxostoma rufum
Curve-billed Thrasher	Toxostoma curvirostre
Hedge Sparrow	Prunella madularis
Robin	Erithacus rubecula
Redstart	Phoenicurus phoenicurus
Eastern Bluebird	Sialia sialis
Mountain Bluebird	Sialia currucoides
Townsend's Solitaire	Myadestes townsendi
Swainson's Thrush	Catharus ustulatus
Blackbird	Turdus merula
Song Thrush	Turdus philomelos
American Robin	Turdus migratorius
Tropical Gnatcatcher	Polioptila plumbea

APPENDIX I. Continued.

Willow Warbler Phylloscopus Karoo Prinia Prinia macu Layard's Tit-babbler Parisoma la	ulosa
Karoo Prinia macu	ulosa
	vardi
Layard's Tit-babbler Parisoma la	
Pied Flycatcher Ficedula hyp	, _
Spotted Flycatcher Muscicapa's	
Long-tailed Tit Aegithalos co	
Marsh Tit Parus palusi	
Willow Tit Parus monta	
Carolina Chickadee Parus caroli	
Mountain Chickadee Parus gambe	
Coal Tit Parus ater	
Great Tit Parus major	•
Blue Tit Parus caeru	
Plain Titmouse Parus inorn	
Tufted Titmouse Parus bicolo	
Nuthatch Sitta europa	
Pygmy Nuthatch Sitta pygmae	
Treecreeper Certhia fam	
Song Sparrow Zonotrichia	
White-throated Sparrow Zonotrichia	
Dark-eyed Junco Junco hyema	
Dusky Seaside Sparrow Ammodrami	
Chipping Sparrow Spizella pass	
Field Sparrow Spizella pusi Rufous-sided Towhee Pipilo erythr	
1 2	
1 3	s nelanocephalus
Cardinal Cardinalis c	4
Scarlet Tanager Piranga oliv Scarlet-rumped Black Tanager Rhamphocel	
Golden-masked Tanager Tangara nig	
Blue Honeycreeper Cyanerpes cy	
Black-and-white Warbler Mniotilta va	
Blue-winged Warbler Vermivora p Yellow Warbler Dendroica p	
- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
Blackburnian Warbler Dendroica fu	
Yellow-rumped Warbler Dendroica co	
Kirtland's Warbler Dendroica k	
American Redstart Setophaga r	
Ovenbird Seiurus aura	•
Worm-eating Warbler Helmitheros	
Prothonotary Warbler Protonotaria	
Kentucky Warbler Geothlypis for	
Yellow-breasted Chat Icteria viren	
Red-eyed Vireo Vireo olivaco	
	eus flavoviridis²
Northern Oriole Icterus galbi	
Red-winged Blackbird Agelaius pho	
Common Grackle Quiscalus qu	
Chaffinch Fringilla coe	
Serin Serinus cana	
Linnet Acanthis can	nnabina

APPENDIX I. Continued.

Common name	Scientific name
Purple Finch	Carpodacus purpureus
House Finch	Carpodacus mexicanus
Hawfinch	Coccothraustes coccothraustes
Zebra Finch	Poephila guttata
Bengalese Finch	Lonchura striata
House Sparrow	Passer domesticus
Starling	Sturnus vulgaris

¹ Common names for North American records follow the AOU Checklist (AOU 1957 and supplements).

APPENDIX II. List of journals reviewed. Following the title of each journal listed is the date of earliest volume reviewed followed by volume or issue numbers. Parentheses indicate that the volumes enclosed were incomplete or missing. A dash between numbers indicates a continuous run. A dash not followed by a number indicates all volumes were reviewed after the last one listed. The literature reviews were conducted in Waldo Library at Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, and the Josselyn Van Tyne Memorial Library at the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor and reflect their journal holdings.

² According to Peters (1931).